

# HALACHIC AND HASHKAFIC ISSUES IN CONTEMPORARY SOCIETY

## 204 - PURIM MESHULASH OU ISRAEL CENTER - WINTER 2020/21

• Purim Meshulash<sup>1</sup> - the three day Purim - is a relatively rare occurrence. In the last 40 years we celebrated Purim Meshulash only five times: in 1981, 1994, 2001, 2005 and 2008. We have the treat of celebrating it this year and again in 2025, after which there will be a 20 year gap until 2045, then 2048, 2052 and then 2072!

### A] 5781 - A REMARKABLE YEAR!

• This year is a very unusual calendric year in many ways<sup>2</sup>. In technical terms it is classified as a א'ח"א<sup>3</sup> year which occurs on average only every 23 years (our last one was in 5761 and the one before that back in 5737). Some of the unusual feature of this years include:

- (i) No Torah mitzva of shofar (1st day Rosh Hashana fell on Shabbat);
- (ii) No Torah mitzva of lulav (1st day Succot fell on Shabbat);
- (iii) Multiple cases of a 'yaknehaz' kiddush, where Chag is on Motzash and we combine kiddush and havdala<sup>4</sup>;

In fact, there may also be a connection with rabbit hunting! Many old illustrated haggadot include a picture of hunters chasing rabbits at this point in the haggada - see opposite from the 1609 Venice haggada. One theory is that this was places as a pun for 'yaknehaz' because of the yiddish expression 'Jag den Häs' - hunt the hare!<sup>5</sup>

- (iv) No Shabbat Chol Hamoed - Succot or Pesach.
- (v) Megillot Kohelet and Shir HaShirim on Shabbat<sup>6</sup>.
- (vi) Chanuka runs from Friday to Friday, which means that Parashat Miketz does NOT fall on Chanuka, allowing us to read the rare haftara of Miketz about Shlomo ordering the baby to be cut in half.
- (vii) Asara B'Tevet falls on Friday<sup>7</sup> meaning that we had to fast into Shabbat.<sup>8</sup>
- (viii) Parashat Zachor falls on Teruma and not on Tetzave. Tetzave is on Shushan Purim, which means that the Yerushalmim read the same haftara ('Pakadti') two Shabbatot in a row.
- (ix) Purim Meshulash - see below.
- (x) Erev Pesach on Shabbat, with many unique halachic implications - we will iy'H dedicate a shiur to this in a few weeks.
- (xi) This year is also Erev Shemita, which has halachic implications for the end of the year.



1. A number of sefarim have been published on the laws of Purim Meshulash. See Sefer Purim Meshulash by Sraya Divlitzki (2005).

2. See 5781 - An Exceptional Year by Rabbi Yehuda Spitz at [https://ohr.edu/9032#\\_edn2](https://ohr.edu/9032#_edn2)

3. א - because Rosh Hashana falls on Shabbat, ב - because BOTH Cheshvan and Kisleav were 'chaser' - 29 days, and ג - because Pesach starts on a Sunday.

4. 5 in chu'l - second night Rosh Hashana, second night Succot, Simchat Torah, first night Pesach (Leil HaSeder), last night Pesach; and 2 in Israel - second night Rosh Hashana and Leil HaSeder.

5. However, this explanation is complicated by the fact that similar rabbit-hunting scenes appear in a number of Sephardic haggadot (including the Barcelona and Reynolds Haggada), whose readers would not have spoken German, and would, therefore, not have made the connection between the acronym and rabbit-hunting! Additionally, this scene does not always appear with this special Kiddush; sometimes it can be found at the end of the haggada. In at least once instance, this scene does not appear in a haggada at all, but in a Zemirot booklet for Shabbat - see <https://www.bh.org.il/blog-items/run-rabbit-run-yair-achituv-rachel-druck/>

6. Also, Kohelet was read in Israel on the first day of Succot and in chu'l on Shemini Atzeret.

7. The last time this happened was in 2013, on the day of the Great Yerushalmi Blizzard. See Rabbi Spitz's article (fn32) for a list of interesting 'coincidences' about that snowy Friday.

8. Also, unusually we had two 10 Tevet fasts in 2020 - Jan 7 and Dec 25.

**B] THE OBLIGATION TO READ MEGILLAT ESTHER**

1. (יט) על-כֹּף הַיְהוּדִים הַפְּרוּזִים הַפְּרָזִים הַשְּׂבִימִים בְּעַרְי הַפְּרָזוֹת עֲשִׂים אֶת יוֹם אַרְבַּעַה עֶשֶׂר לַחֹדֶשׁ אָדָר שְׂמֵחָה וּמְשֻׁחָה וְיוֹם טוֹב וּמְשֻׁלֹחַ מְנוֹת אִישׁ לְרֵעֵהוּ: (כ) וַיִּכְתֹּב מְרַדְכֵי אֶת-הַדְּבָרִים הָאֵלֶּה וַיִּשְׁלַח סְפָרִים אֶל-כָּל-הַיְהוּדִים אֲשֶׁר בְּכָל-מְדִינֹת הַמְּלֶכֶת אַחַשְׁוֶרְוֶשׁ הַקְּרוּבִים וְהַרְחוּקִים: (כא) לְקִים עֲלֵיהֶם לְהִיּוֹת עֲשִׂים אֶת יוֹם אַרְבַּעַה עֶשֶׂר לַחֹדֶשׁ אָדָר וְאֵת יוֹם-חֲמִשָּׁה עֶשֶׂר בּוֹ בְּכָל-שָׁנָה וְשָׁנָה: (כב) כִּימִים אֲשֶׁר-נָחוּ בָהֶם הַיְהוּדִים מֵאֹיְבֵיהֶם וְהַחֹדֶשׁ אֲשֶׁר נִהְפָּדָה לָהֶם מִיַּד הַמֶּלֶךְ וּמֵאֲבָל לְיוֹם טוֹב לַעֲשׂוֹת אוֹתָם יְמֵי מְשֻׁחָה וּמְשֻׁלֹחַ מְנוֹת אִישׁ לְרֵעֵהוּ וּמִתְּנוּת לְאֲבוֹנִים: ..... (כז) קִיְמוּ וְקִבְּלוּ הַיְהוּדִים עֲלֵיהֶם וְעַל-זָרְעָם וְעַל כָּל-הַנְּלוּיִם עֲלֵיהֶם וְלֹא יַעֲבֹר לְהִיּוֹת עֲשִׂים אֶת שְׁנֵי הַיָּמִים הָאֵלֶּה כְּכַתְּבָם וְכִזְמוּנָם בְּכָל-שָׁנָה וְשָׁנָה: (כח) וְהַיָּמִים הָאֵלֶּה נִזְכָּרִים וְנַעֲשִׂים בְּכָל-דּוֹר וְדוֹר מִשְׁפָּחָה וּמִשְׁפָּחָה מְדִינָה וּמְדִינָה וְעִיר וְעִיר וְיָמֵי הַפְּרוּזִים הָאֵלֶּה לֹא יַעֲבֹרוּ מִתְּוֹךְ הַיְהוּדִים וְזָכְרָם לֹא-יִסּוּף מִזָּרְעָם: ט

אסתר פרק ט

*Megillat Esther describes the establishment of the holiday of Purim on the 14th and (for walled cities) 15th of Adar. All aspects of Purim - feasting, simcha, gifts to friends (Mishloach Manot) and gifts to the poor (Matanot Le'evyonim) are listed explicitly. But where is the mitzva to read the Megilla!?*

2. אשכחן עשייה, זכירה מנלו? אמר קרא וְהַיָּמִים הָאֵלֶּה נִזְכָּרִים וְנַעֲשִׂים. איתקש זכירה לעשייה.

מגילה ב

*Chazal learn this from the conjunction of the mitzva of 'asiya' - doing the positive acts on Purim that are required and 'zechira' - remembering<sup>9</sup> the story through reading the Megilla.*

3. ואמר רבי יהושע בן לוי: חייב אדם לקרות את המגילה בלילה ולשנותה ביום, שנאמר (תהלים כב:ג) אֲלֹהֵי אֲקַרְא יוֹמָם וְלַיְלָה תַעֲנֶנּוּ.

מגילה ד

*R. Yehoshua b. Levi learns from Tehillim<sup>10</sup> that the Megilla must be read twice on Purim - at night<sup>11</sup> and again by day.*

4. חייב אדם לקרות את המגילה בלילה ולשנותה ביום - אומר ר"י דאף על גב דמזכר זמן זלילה חוזר ומזכר אותו ביום, דעיקר פרסומי ניסא הוי בקריאה דיממא. וקרא נמי משמע כן דכתיב ולילה ולא דומיה לוי - כלומר אף על גב שקורא ביום חייב לקרות זלילה. והעיקר הוי זיממא כיון שהזכירו הכתוב תחילה. וגם עיקר הסעודה זיממא הוא כדאמר לקמן (דף ט:): דאם אכלה זלילה לא ילא י"ח. והכי נמי משמע מדכתיב מזכרים ונעשים - ואיתקש זכירה לעשייה, מה עיקר עשייה זיממא אף זכירה כן.

תוספות ט

*Tosafot<sup>12</sup> learn that the main reading of Megilla is the DAY reading.*

5. קריאת המגילה בזמנה מצות עשה מדברי סופרים, והדברים ידועים שהיא תקנת נביאים

רמב"ם הלכות מגילה וחנוכה פרק א הלכה א

*Rambam describes the reading of the Megilla as both 'Divrei Sofrim' - ie Rabbinic, and 'Takanat Nevi'im' - ie pre-Rabbinic from the prophets.<sup>13</sup>*

• An interesting question arises in a case where someone can only attend one reading. Do they skip the night and go to the day reading since that has a higher status or do they attend the night reading so as not to skip over mitzvot<sup>14</sup>.

9. 'Zachor' in halacha almost always involves a mitzva not only to remember but also to recite words out loud which include that remembrance. Consider 'Zachor' on Shabbat which is not only a mitzva to remember the Creation but to recite kiddush. 'Zachor' to remembering Amalek includes the reading of Parashat Zachor. See Rambam Hil. Chametz U'Matza 7:1 where he learns the mitzva of מצרים אשר יצאתם ממצרים (Shemot 13:3) as the source to recite the Haggada and recount the miracles of the Exodus.

10. This Tehilla - 23 - is 'Lamantzeach al Ayelet HaShachar', which is associated with Esther.

11. Rav Soloveitchik (Hararei Kedem Vol 1 p.334-5) understands, based on the Netziv (intro to Ha'emek Davar ot bet) that the 'real' holiday of Purim only begins in the morning and the night time reading is just to prepare one for the daytime reading. Bircei Yosef (OC 687) actually quotes opinions that someone who missed the nighttime reading should read TWICE during the day, although he disagreed with this.

12. This is also the position of the Rosh and the Ran - see Aruch HaShulchan OC 687:2. Aruch HaShulchan understands that this is also the position of the Rambam, even though he rules that the Shehechyanu is only by night. However, the Rokeach (Hilchot Berachot 363) understands that the nighttime reading is the main one.

13. Many mefarshim explain that the DAY reading is 'midivrei kabbala' - rooted in Tanach and a status between deoraita and derabbanan. However the NIGHT reading is purely Rabbinic - see Node BeYehuda Kamma OC 41, Sha'arei Teshuva OC 687 and Pri Megadim 687:2-3. Pnei Yehoshua (Megilla 4a s.v. chayav) learns that this is because the battles only took place by day. The Binyan Shlomo (58) understands that the nighttime reading was only introduced by the Amora R. Yehoshua b. Levi and that, up to that time, Megilla was only read by day. Note that R. Mordechai Eliyahu understood that the night reading is also midivrei Kabbala.

14. This question arises in multiple scenarios - does a person delay a mitzva to fulfil it in a more optimal manner, or take the first mitzva opportunity one can. Eg if a prisoner is allowed out to daven one tefilla with a minyan, should that be the next one or should they save it for Shabbat/Chag/Yamim Noraim. If a person is told in Elul that they can fast only one day for medical reasons should they do so on Tzom Gedalia or wait until Yom Kippur. This is a machloket Rishonim with numerous applications.

**C] READING MEGILLA ON SHABBAT**

6. א מגילה נקראת באחד עשר, בשנים עשר, בשלשה עשר, בארבעה עשר, בחמשה עשר. לא פחות ולא יותר. כרכין המוקפין חומה מימות יהושע בן נון קורין בחמשה עשר, כפרים ועיירות גדולות קורין בארבעה עשר. אלא שהכפרים מקדימין ליום הכניסה.
- ב כיצד? חל להיות יום ארבעה עשר .... ערב שבת - כפרים מקדימין ליום הכניסה ועיירות גדולות ומוקפות חומה קורין בו ביום ....

משנה מסכת מגילה פרק א

*The Mishna gives various dates for the reading of the Megilla<sup>15</sup>. If 14th Adar falls on a Friday (as this year) the Mishna states that the Megilla will be read on Friday BOTH in the towns AND in the walled cities.*

7. דכולי עלמא מיהא מגילה בשבת לא קרינן. מאי טעמא? אמר רבה: הכל חייבין בקריאת מגילה, ואין הכל בקיין במקרא מגילה. גזירה שמא יטלנה בידו וילך אצל בקי ללמוד, ויעבירה ארבע אמות ברשות הרבים. והיינו טעמא דשופר, והיינו טעמא דלולב. רב יוסף אמר: מפני שענייהן של עניים נשואות במקרא מגילה.

מגילה ז:

*The Megilla brings two reasons why we cannot read it on Shabbat but bring it forward<sup>16</sup> to Friday. The first is 'gezeira deRabba' - in case someone panics because they need someone to read Megilla for them and they carry a scroll on Shabbat. (This is also the reason why we do not blow shofar or shake lulav on Shabbat<sup>17</sup>.) The second reason is because the poor are used to collecting their Matanot Le'evyonim around the reading of Megilla and giving out money is prohibited on Shabbat.*

- As such, when 15 Adar falls on Shabbat<sup>18</sup>, Yerushalayim<sup>19</sup> reads on Friday with the rest of the world.
- One fundamental question is whether the earlier reading for Yerushalayim is considered a reading at the correct time midvrei kabbala, or an advanced reading instituted later by the Rabbis<sup>20</sup>. This has a number of halachic implications<sup>21</sup>:

(i) Can a Yerushalmi read the megilla for a Tel Avivi<sup>22</sup>?

If Friday is the 'ideal' time for megilla reading enacted by the Anshei Knesset Hagedola, even for the Yerushalmi, then he can read for the Tel Avivi since their level of obligation of is the same. If the earlier reading is a later Rabbinic innovation then the Yerushalmi will have a Rabbinic obligation but the Tel Avivi will have higher obligation by day - midvrei Kabbala<sup>23</sup>. In practice, a Yerushalmi should NOT read for a Tel Avivi on the Friday.<sup>24</sup>

(ii) Is a quorum of 10 required?<sup>25</sup>

According to many Rishonim, where Megilla reading is not in its proper time, it is only possible if there is a congregation<sup>26</sup>. If the Friday reading for a Yerushalmi is considered not to be the 'proper' time, then ten people will be necessary. The Mishna Berura<sup>27</sup> rules that an individual Yerushalmi who reads Megilla on the Friday should do so without a beracha.

15. The earlier dates of 11th, 12th and 13th are no longer applicable, but were relevant when villagers would go into the bigger towns on Mondays and Thursday to have someone in the town read Megilla for them. Megillat Esther refers to the whole month of Adar as special for this miracle, and the Gemara derives from the wording of the Megilla that not only the 14th and 15th, but other (earlier) dates were also acceptable for the reading of the Megilla.

16. The Gemara learns from the wording of the Megilla 'velo ya'avov' that the reading may be brought forward but may not be delayed until after 15th Adar.

17. Many mefarshim ask why gezeira deRabba was not applied to a brit on Shabbat. See Ritva Succa 42a and Minchat Chinuch mitzva 9. See also the detailed article by Rav Rimon cited below, where Rav Rimon gives a number of explanations for this.

18. 14th Adar cannot fall on Shabbat in our fixed calendar.

19. Yerushalayim is the only 'walled city' (ie definitely walled in the time of Yehoshua bin Nun) which reads on 15th with a beracha. Some other cities in Eretz Yisrael are questionable and customarily read on both days (14th with a beracha and 15th without, due to the doubt). These include Yaffo, Lod, Akko, Tzfat, Haifa, Beersheva, Chevron, Shechem and Gaza. Teveria also reads on both days for different reasons. Since it is located on the Kinneret it was protected from invaders by a combination of walls and the sea. If we define a 'walled city' literally, then Teveria does not qualify. But if we view a 'walled city' as one protected from invasion, then it does. The Sage Chizkiya instituted a Megilla reading in Teveria on both days, which is a ruling cited in Shulchan Aruch as a precedent for all cities whose status is uncertain. (See OC 688:4, and Mishna Berura 688:9).

20. See Turei Even (Megilla 5a s.v. a'sh zemanam). According to him, this chakira concerning whether Friday or Shabbat is the 'ideal' day for Yerushalmim may indeed be the machloket between Rabba and Rav Yosef. See R. Zvi Pesach Frank, Mikra'ei Kodesh, Purim #51, who brings those who disagree with the Turei Even.

21. See <https://www.etzion.org.il/en/concise-guide-laws-purim-meshulash> for a concise guide by Rav Yosef Tzvi Rimon and <https://www.etzion.org.il/en/purim-meshulash-part-1-3> for a more detailed analysis by Rav Rimon. See also Rabbi Yirmiyahu Kagenoff's articles at [yeshiva.com/midrash/7249](http://yeshiva.com/midrash/7249) and [yeshiva.com/midrash/7214](http://yeshiva.com/midrash/7214).

22. This is defined, according most poskim, by where they sleep on the night of 14th Adar. Wherever they wake up on the morning of 14th fixes their status. So our cases would be a someone who slept in Yerushalayim but drove to Tel Aviv on Purim morning to hear Megilla.

23. This would be comparable to a child (who is obligated on a Rabbinic level) reading for an adult (who is obligated midvrei Kabbala, at least by day) on Purim.

24. In principle, this would be less of a problem a night, when the obligation is always Rabbinic, according to many poskim. It would also not be a problem for a Tel Avivi to read for a Yerushalmi. The Yerushalmi should preferably not be called up to the Torah on that Friday since HIS day for the special Torah reading is Shabbat.

25. Since the purpose of the quorum is *pirsumei nisa* - to publicize the miracle in the community, some poskim rule that women can constitute a quorum as well as men. A halachic minyan in NOT required to fulfil the obligation of reading Megilla (unlike the case of kriyat haTorah).

26. This is the ruling of the Shulchan Aruch lechatchila. Megilla reading must create 'pirsumei nisa' and this can be achieved either by reading it on the proper day OR with a quorum.

27. 690:61

But the Chazon Ish and many other authorities<sup>28</sup> are lenient, and put together additional arguments to conclude that when a Yerushalmi is forced to read the Megilla as an individual on the Friday, he may do so with a beracha.

(iii) Is a women's Megilla reading permitted in Yerushalayim on the Friday?

According to some poskim, women are not regarded as a 'tzibur' for this halacha<sup>29</sup>. As such, according to the Mishna Berura they must hear megilla reading in a synagogue in such a year. Many other authorities, however, have ruled leniently on two grounds: (a) it is that a quorum of ten is not needed in this case; and (b) it is possible that women DO constitute a tzibur for this purpose since there is pirsmei nisa. This leniency was accepted by the Chazon Ish, Rav Zvi Pesach Frank and others<sup>30</sup>. Some poskim rule that women should try, where possible, to hear Megilla on the Friday either in a minyan of 10 men or in a quorum of 10 women.

(iv) Travelling between Tev Aviv and Yerushalayim

Again, the fundamental question is this: is the 'ideal/proper' day for walled cities actually Friday or still Shabbat. So, if a Tel Avivi fulfilled all his mitzvot on Friday and then went to Jerusalem for Shabbat, he may or may not have to do all the mitzvot AGAIN according to the Yerushalmim ie say Al Hanisim on Shabbat and do the Seuda and Mishloach Manot on Sunday (as we shall see below). The poskim disagree. Some are lenient but others rule that he should ideally observe (at least minimally) the mitzvot of Mishloach Manot and Seuda on Sunday<sup>31</sup> (even if he is back in Tel Aviv).

A Tel Avivi who travels to Yerushalayim on Motzei Shabbat does not need to do any of the Purim mitzvot on Sunday.

Similarly, if a Yerushalmi was in Jerusalem on Friday (and heard Megilla and gave Matanot Le'evyonim), ideally he should not travel to Tel Aviv for Shabbat, since his actual obligation might only fall on Shabbat, and he will therefore lose out on Purim. In any event he will also lose out on Purim Torah reading and al hanisim on Shabbat. If he did travel to Tel Aviv for Shabbat, many poskim rule that he should recite Al Hanisim on Shabbat (according to some, he should say it after the Amida in in *Elokai Netzor* or after bentsching the the *harachamans*). If he then returns to Yerushalayim on motzash, he should give Mishloach Manot and celebrate the Seuda on Sunday. If he stays in Tel Aviv for Sunday, some poskim rule that he should have a Seuda and send Mishloach Manot on Sunday<sup>32</sup>.

(v) Reading along quietly with the public Megilla reading

If a person has a kosher megilla scroll and reads quietly along together with the public reading, according to the Chazon Ish<sup>33</sup> this is considered a reading in a tzibur but, according to the Brisker Rov<sup>34</sup>, this is regarded as an individual reading which may not be permitted for the Yerushalmi on the Friday. According to this, on Purim Meshulash, a person should not read along quietly to himself. However, if he keeps pace with the public reading and also hears it, this will be considered a public reading, even according to those who are stringent.

(vi) A boy or girl who reaches bar/bat mitzva on Shabbat 15th Adar

If a minor reaches majority on this Shabbat then, if the obligation comes into being only on Shabbat, he might have to read the Megilla<sup>35</sup> a second time on Shabbat<sup>36</sup>, since on Friday he was still a minor! In practice, the poskim rules that he does not read the Megilla again on Shabbat.

(vii) Someone who was unable to read on Friday due to reasons beyond their control

If, for reasons beyond their control, a person failed to read on Friday, should he read it on Shabbat? If the obligation truly comes into being only on Shabbat, perhaps he should read it. In practice, the poskim rule that he should not read the Megilla on Shabbat.

28. Chazon Ish (155:2); Shu't Yabi'a Omer (6 OC:46); Torat Hamo'adim, pp. 353-355; Rav Tykocinski (Ir Hakodesh VehoMikdash I, chap. 26, no. 2); Shu't Salmat Chayyim (R. Yosef Chayyim Sonnenfeld) OC 102-103; R. Shlomo Zalman Auerbach (VeAlehu Lo Yibol, p. 245).

29. We will look iy'H at women and Megilla in more depth in the following shiur.

30. Chazon Ish (155:2); R. Zvi Pesach Frank (Mikra'ei Kodesh, Purim #50); R. Shlomo Zalman Auerbach (Halichot Shelomo p. 276).

31. Some poskim draw a distinction between a resident Tel Avivi that spent Friday in Tel Aviv and then went to Yerushalayim for Shabbat (who is exempt from keeping Purim Meshulash) and a resident Yerushalmi who happened to be in Tel Aviv on Thursday night/Fri and then came back to Yerushalayim for Shabbat (who may be more obligated in Purim Meshulash).

32. He may need to send these to someone in Yerushalayim, depending on whether the recipient must be celebrating Purim or not. According to the reasoning of the Terumat HaDeshen that the mishloach manot are for the Seuda, the recipient must be celebrating Purim. According to the Manot Halevi that the reason is to bring unity and friendship between Jews, the recipient need not be celebrating on that day. There are other implications to the different reasons for giving mishloach manot, such as where the intended recipient refuses to accept them, or where the gift is from a wealthy person but is minimal (ie sufficient to be a minimal seuda but not to bring shalom!).

33. Chazon Ish 155:2

34. Cited by R. Moshe Sternbuch, Moadim U'zmanim, 2:173; Teshuvot Vehanhagot, 2:349.

35. This was the position of R. Yosef Chayim Sonnenfeld (shu't Tzitz Hakodesh, #55); R. Tzvi Pesach Frank (Har Tzvi, 2:127), Rav Vosner (Shevet Halevi 5:83); and Rav Tykocinski (Ir Hakodesh Vehamikdash 3:26:9).

36. In this unusual case, and the following one, maybe the gezeira deRabba not to read on Shabbat would not apply to an individual.

## D] PURIM MESHULASH - WHEN TO DO THE MITZVOT

- In practice<sup>37</sup>, on Purim Meshulash the mitzvot of Purim are divided between the Friday, Shabbat and Sunday.

8. יום חמשה עשר שחל להיות בשבת - אין קורין המגילה בשבת, אלא מקדימים לקרותה בערב שבת. וגובים מעות מתנות עניים ומחלקים אותם בו ביום. וביום שבת מוציאים שני ספרים ובשני קורין ויבא עמלק, ואומרים: על הנסים. ואין עושים סעודת פורים עד יום אחד בשבת.

שולחן ערוך אורח חיים הלכות מגילה ופורים סימן תרפ"ט סעיף ו

*The Shulchan Aruch rules that we do the following:*

**Friday:** Megilla and Matanot Le'evyonim

**Shabbat:** Purim Torah reading<sup>38</sup> and Al Hanisim

**Sunday:** Purim Seuda (and Mishloach Manot<sup>39</sup>)

### D1] MEGILLA READING

- All agree that this must be on Friday<sup>40</sup> - see above.
- This will mean that, unusually, even Yerushalmim will read the evening Megilla while still fasting. If necessary to focus, one may certainly eat a non-mezonot snack - eg fruit, dairy, rice before Megilla, or a less than a kezayit of mezonot. If one might feel ill or weak during Megilla one can eat normally beforehand.

### D2] MATANOT LE'EVYONIM

- All agree that this<sup>41</sup> must be at the same time as Megilla reading on Friday<sup>42</sup>. This is stated explicitly in the Gemara - see above.
- Some poskim (especially Chabad<sup>43</sup>) advise that Matanot Le'evyonim should be given again on the Sunday.

### D3] RECITING AL HANISIM

9. ומלאתי כתוב שמנהג ירושלים לגבות מעות מתנות עניים ולחלקם בו ביום, ואין אומרים בו על הנסים ואין מויליין בו ספר תורה. ... וזשבת יום ט"ו שהוא יום פורים אומרים על הנסים, ומויליין בו שני ספרים, וקורין בשני ויבוא עמלק (שמות י"ז-ט"ו). ותמנהי למה לא יאמרו על הנסים ביום ששי שבו קורין המגילה?!

בית יוסף אורח חיים סימן תרפ"ט (ו)

*Although the final halacha is that this is said on Shabbat<sup>44</sup>, the Beit Yosef expresses great surprise that it is not in fact said on the Friday, when we read the Megilla<sup>45</sup>!*

- If a person made a mistake and said Al Hanisim on Friday OR on Sunday, he does not have to go back<sup>46</sup>.
- According to some poskim it is advisable to say Al Hanisim on Sunday at the Seuda in the bentching in the *harachamans* following the Purim meal.<sup>47</sup>

### D4] WORKING ON FRIDAY/SUNDAY

- Although working on the actual day of Purim is discouraged<sup>48</sup>, it is permitted<sup>49</sup> for Yerushalmim to work on the Friday of Purim Meshulash. However, many have a minhag not to work on the Friday.
- Yerushalmim should also wear Shabbat clothes on Friday in honor of Purim, even though their 'real' Purim is the following day.
- Work on Sunday is permitted but some have a minhag not to work from chatzot on Sunday which is the time for the Seuda.

37. See <https://www.etzion.org.il/en/purim-meshulash-continued-part-2-3> for a detailed analysis by Rav Rimon.

38. This is followed by the haftara of Zachor.

39. Mishna Berura 688:18.

40. It is not pushed off to Sunday because of the halacha learnt from 'velo ya'avur' - that the Megilla may not be postponed beyond the 15th.

41. The minhag to give machatzit hashekel will also be fulfilled by Yerushalmim on the Thursday afternoon.

42. R. Yosef Chaim Sonnenfeld rules that, if a Yerushalmi did not give them on Friday, they should give them on Sunday.

43. See Likkutei Sichot 21 p490 and Shulchan Menachem 3/330.

44. This seems to indicate that the 'real' day of Purim for Yerushalmim is actually Shabbat and not Friday - see above and Mishna Berura 688:17.

45. It is also strange that Al Hanisim becomes disconnected from the Purim Seuda - a real 'venahafoch hu'.

46. See Mishna Berura 688:17 and also 108:38 regarding someone who inadvertently spoke during the Amida. See also Ir Hakodesh Vehamikdash 26:2. In general, if a person forgot to say Al Hanisim they do not need to repeat the Amida or Bircat HaMazon, but if they remember before they finish, they should insert it into *Elokai Netzor* or in the *harachamans* (there is often a line in the birconim to introduce this, beginning with 'harachaman hu yas' se lanu nissim....').

47. See Shu't Halachot Ketanot 2: 136; Kaf Hachayim 688:48.

48. Chazal says that one will not see any siman beracha from such work. See also Rema OC 696:1.

49. Shu't Yabia Omer 6:47.

D5] SHEHECHIYANU

• This is said<sup>50</sup> on Friday with the Megilla reading. Normally, we have in mind that this will also cover the other mitzvot of the day. But on Purim Meshulash these other mitzvot will happen only on Shabbat and Sunday! R. Shlomo Zalman Auerbach said that this still works and one should have kavana in the beracha for the following days. Others have a minhag to wear new clothes<sup>51</sup> on the Shabbat and/or Sunday in order to say Shehechiyanu then too.

D6] PURIM TORAH READING

10. כתב הר"צ שאין קריאת מגילה בשבת גזירה שמא יטלנה וכו'. דהכל חייבין בקריאת מגילה ואין הכל בקריאת כדאיתא בגמרא. וקשיא לי א"כ למה קורין בס"ת בשבת כדחנן בפרק בתרא. וכ"פ הר"צ בסמוך בפרשת ויצא עמלק. אבל בקריאת הלל ל"ק דרשאין לקרות בעל פה כיון דרגילין בו..... וניחא לי במ"ש בטור א"ח ר"ס קל"ט דהקורא בפרשה לריך לסדר אותה תחלה פעמים ושלש זינו לזין עלמו וכו' וא"כ כל הקורין בקריאת הן. דומיא לתירון ז' דתוספות במילה שלא גזרו ... דטעמא דאין אדם מל א"כ הוא בקי.

תוספות יום טוב מסכת מגילה פרק א משנה ב

*Tosafot Yom Tov asks why we do not prohibit the Purim Torah reading (or indeed every Torah reading!) on Shabbat in case someone comes to carry a Torah on Shabbat to someone who can teach them. He answers that ba'alei keriya are all experts (as are mohalim who are also allowed to do mila on Shabbat.)<sup>52</sup>*

D7] PURIM DERASHA

11. (טז) ... ושואלין ודורשין בו זיוס בהלכות פורים כדי שיזכרו ענין היום. וכשחל בחול יולאין ע"י קריאת מגילה.

משנה ברורה סימן תרפח:טז

*The Mishna Berura rules that there is a special halacha to hold a Purim Derasha on the Shabbat to explain the laws of Purim. Normally, the Megilla reading on the day serves in place of this, but on Purim Meshulash this has already been done on Friday.*

D8] PURIM SEUDA

• Why can't the Purim Seuda take place on Shabbat?

12. סעודת ראש חדש וסעודת פורים מאחרין ולא מקדימין. ר' זעירה בעא קומי ר' אבהו - ויעשו אותן שבת! א"ל (אסתר ט:כב) לעשות אותם ימי משתה ושמחה - את ששמחתו תלויה בב"ד, יצא זה ששמחתו תלויה בידי שמים.

תלמוד ירושלמי (וילנא) מסכת מגילה פרק א

*The Yerushalmi asks this question and answers that Purim must be on a day which the Rabbis designated for simcha and not which God did!*

- Is the problem that the Purim Seuda will detract from Shabbat<sup>53</sup>, or that the Shabbat seuda will detract from Purim?
- Is there really a din of 'simcha' on Shabbat, or only 'oneg'?

13. ופירשו בירושלמי (פ"א ה"ד) שאם חל פורים בשבת מאחרין הסעודה עד אחר השבת כדי שתהא שמחת פורים ניכרת ולא תתערבב בסעודת שבת. .... ואין הירושלמי הזה צרור. דהא כי כתיב ולא יעבור - אפילו אשמחה נמי הוא, דנזכרים ונעשים כתוב שם.

חידושי הריטב"א מגילה ה.

*The Ritva disagrees with the Yerushalmi<sup>54</sup> on the basis that the din 'velo ya'avov' - that Purim cannot be made later - also applies to the Seuda. As such, making the Seuda on 16th Adar is unacceptable.*

50. There is a dispute, even in a regular year, as to whether Shehechiyanu is repeated by day. Ashkenazim do repeat it but Sefardim do not. For explanations of the different positions see [outorah.org/p/33321/](http://outorah.org/p/33321/). Note that the Breuer community does NOT say the Shehechiyanu in the morning (or over shofar on second day Rosh Hashana), R. Yaakov Emden rules that if one was not able to read Megilla at all on Purim, they say Shehechiyanu over the wine at the meal! (Siddur of R. Yaakov Emden, Bircat HeMegilla 5). See Biur Halacha 692:1 on the issue.

51. One could also have a new fruit.

52. Others answer that since Torah reading is a COMMUNAL obligation and not a personal one, the gezeira deRabba does not apply. This also applies to other megillot which we have a custom to read even on Shabbat, such as Rut, Kohelet and Shir HaShirim. Alternatively, since it occurs every Shabbat, we are not concerned that someone may forget and carry a Torah scroll on Shabbat.

53. R. Yosef Chaim Sonnenfeld gives another reason for delaying the seuda until Sunday since making it on Friday or Shabbat would interfere with regular preparations for Shabbat on Friday.

54. Note that the Meshech Chochma on Megillat Esther understands that the intention of the Yerushalmi is that the seuda should be on Motzei Shabbat! This is not followed in practice.

- Sefer Eshkol rules that the main Purim meal should be on the Shabbat and that the meal on Sunday is simply a 'make-up' meal.
- The Meiri rules that the Purim meal should be on the Friday<sup>55</sup>. This is not the halacha since most poskim rules that the 'real' Purim is Shabbat and that Friday is simply an allowance for reading Megilla.

14. (יח) ואין עושין וכו' - דאמרינן צירושלמי ויעשו אותם בשבת? א"ל ימי משתה כחוב את ששמחתו תלויה צ"ד ילא זה שבת ששמחתו צידי שמים היא. וה"ה ממילא ששילוח מנות גם ציום א' בשבת. והנה מהר"ל חציב האריך להוכיח דצבלי שלנו אין סובר כן, ודעתו שהסעודה היא בשבת, ועשה כן מעשה צירושלים וגם משלוח מנות בשבת כי המנות הם מהסעודה.

משנה ברורה סימן תרפח

*The Mishna Berura brings views that the Seuda should be on Shabbat<sup>56</sup> (and that this is actually the position of the Bavli against the Yerushalmi).*

- Although the psak is that the Seuda should be on Sunday, some add a special Purim meal on Shabbat too<sup>57</sup>, or at least add an extra dish and/or a special wine on Shabbat in honor of Purim. Some also add a special dish on Friday too.<sup>58</sup>
- Yerushalmim should also wear Shabbat clothes on the Sunday in honor of Purim.

## D9] MISHLOACH MANOT

- There are two reasons given by the mefarshim for Mishloach Manot:

(i) To ensure that people have food to eat for the Seuda.<sup>59</sup>

(ii) To create friendship between people.<sup>60</sup>

According to the first reason, since the Seuda is on Sunday, Mishloach Manot must also be on Sunday. According to the second reason, they could be on Friday or Shabbat<sup>61</sup>.

- The Chazon Ish<sup>62</sup> ruled that Mishloach Manot should be sent on FRIDAY, at the same time as Matanot Le'evyonim.
- Pri Chadash ruled that Mishloach Manot should be on SHABBAT and SUNDAY.

- In practice, the halacha is that Mishloach Manot should be given on Sunday. Some have a minhag to also give (to one person) on Friday and Shabbat, or to share some of their Shabbat food with one of the neighbors.

## D10] IS THE MEGILLA MUKTZE ON SHABBAT?

15. .... והנה הפר"ח אוסר לטלטל המגילה בשבת מאחר שאין קורין בו אצל כמה אחרונים חולקין עליו ומתירין.

משנה ברורה סימן תרפח

*The Pri Chadash rules that the Megilla scroll is muktze for Yerushalmim on Shabbat since they are not permitted to read it in public. It would not be muktze for those outside Yerushalayim who are not keeping Purim. Others rule that it is never muktze.<sup>63</sup>*

## D11] HALLEL ON SHABBAT!?

16. ... הלל נמי נימא! - לפי שאין אומרים הלל על נס שבחוצה לארץ .... רב נחמן אמר: קרייתא זו הלילא. רבא אמר: בשלמא התם הללו עבדי ה' - ולא עבדי פרעה, אלא הכא - הללו עבדי ה' ולא עבדי אחשוורוש! אכתי עבדי אחשוורוש אנן!

מגילה יד.

*The Gemara asks why we do not say Hallel on Purim. One answer is that the Megilla functions as a Hallel<sup>64</sup>.*

55. Some poskim understand that this is the intent of the Yerushalmi, which does not actually state that the meal should be on Sunday, just not on Shabbat.

56. This was the practical psak of the Maharalbach - R. Levi ibn Chaviv - Rav of Yerushalayim in the 16th Century, who understood this to be the position of the Bavli. The Taz (688:8) follows this position but the Magen Avraham (688:10) and most poskim rule that the Seuda should be on Sunday. According to the Maharalbach there is no such thing as Purim Meshulash at all, as all the mitzvot take place on Friday and Shabbat! For him, Sunday is a regular day with tachanun etc.

57. This may however be a problem if the psak is that the Purim meal will detract from Shabbat. R. Shlomo Kluger also suggests that there would be a problem holding a seudat Purim on Shabbat since one should become drunk and would not then be able to fulfill the mitzva of 'Zachor et yom HaShabbat lekadsho' - see shu't Ha'alef Lecha Shelomo (OC 385).

58. See Kaf ha-Chayyim (688:38 and 45); Calendar for Eretz Israel by Rav Tykocinski.

59. Terumat HaDeshen 131; Kolbo 45; Orchot Chayim, Hilchot Purim 36).

60. Sefer Manot Halevi (Rav Alkabetz, chap. 9, sec. 19), cited in shu't Chatam Sofer (OC 196), Maharal (Or Chadash 9:22), and Bach (end of sec. 695).

61. Some poskim (Chazon Ish 155:1) prohibited sending gifts on Shabbat due to concerns of hilchot Shabbat (carrying, giving gifts). Orchot Chayim even writes that since it is impossible to give Mishloach Manot on Shabbat, they must be pushed off to Sunday, and THAT is the reason why the Seuda is also pushed to Sunday. The Maharalbach (see above) ruled that they should be given on Shabbat without carrying etc.

62. 155

63. Generally speaking, kitvei kodesh are never muktze since they can be used to learn on Shabbat. That applies even if they are very valuable (and might have been assumed to be muktze machamat chisaron kis.)

64. The Meiri rules that on any Purim on which no Megilla is available, one should say Hallel.

- As such, the Pri Megadim<sup>65</sup> rules that, on Purim Meshulash, the Yerushalmim should sing Hallel on Shabbat, since this is their Purim and there is no Megilla! This is not the practice.<sup>66</sup>

## D12] AVEILUT ON PURIM

- The accepted minhag is that there is no public mourning during Shiva on Purim<sup>67</sup>. There is a dispute as to whether this applied on the Sunday of Purim Meshulash.

## D13] PURIM COSTUME

- Some poskim rule that one should dress up for Purim on whichever day one is celebrating with wine and the Seuda.<sup>68</sup>

## E] PURIM ON FRIDAY FOR UNWALLED CITIES

- A number of halachic issues arise for residents of unwalled cities who celebrate Purim on Friday.

### E1] PURIM SEUDA ON FRIDAY

17. וכשחל פורים ציוס ששייטשו הסעודה בשחרית, משום כבוד שבת.

רמ"א שולחן ערוך אורח חיים הלכות מגילה ופורים סימן תרצה סעיף ב'

*Most poskim rule<sup>69</sup> that the Purim Seuda must be eaten on Friday morning (before noon) or at least before mincha ketana (nine and a half hours into the day<sup>70</sup>).*

- There are individuals who have the custom to celebrate the meal on Friday afternoon<sup>71</sup>. The procedure (known as 'Pores Mappa' from the discussion of this in Gemara Pesachim) will then be as follows:
  - When Shabbat arrives, they cover the bread and recite kiddush (without reciting another borei hagafen).
  - They then say Kabbalat Shabbat.
  - After that they continue the meal, eating at least a kezayit (and preferably a kebeitza) of bread for the Shabbat meal.
  - When they finish their meal, they recite Bircat Hamazon with Retzei (if bread was eaten after nightfall) but its is not clear whether Al Hanisim should be added. Most poskim say to add it since the miracle also occurred on the 15th.
  - Ma'ariv follows, not always with a minyan<sup>72</sup>!
- Although some poskim accept the 'Pores Mappa' option as a viable alternative, most regard it as bedieved and some are firmly opposed!<sup>73</sup>

### E2] TACHANUN ON SUNDAY

- In Jerusalem there is no Tachanun on Sunday since this is still part of Purim Meshulash.
- But what about other places, where 16th Adar is not Purim at all? R. Shlomo Zalman Auerbach<sup>74</sup> writes that the custom is that even those in other locations do not say Tachanun (or Lamanatzeiach) on that day. Some do say both.
- Some poskim (especially Chabad) rule that even those outside Yerushalayim should increase festivities on the Sunday and even have a special 'Shushan Purim' feast on the Sunday rather than motzei Shabbat.

18. שאחד המרבה ואחד הממעיט ובלבד שיכוין אדם את דעתו לשמים.

משנה מסכת מנחות פרק יג משנה יא

*This rare opportunity to celebrate an extended Purim can be exciting and meaningful, but only as long as Chazal's advice is heeded - those who do more and those who do less are equally praiseworthy, as long as everyone's intentions are leShem Shamayim.*

65. Ashel Avraham 693:2

66. See Minchat Yitzchak 8:64 where Dayan Weiss debates the issue and concludes that one should not say Hallel. However, some poskim rule that a Yerushalmi who missed Megilla on Friday, or a boy or girl who became bar/bat mitzva on the Shabbat, should say full Hallel without a beracha on Shabbat! (See Sefer Purim Meshulash, R. Sraya Duvlitsky p102-3)

67. Shulchan Aruch OC 697:4

68. Piskei Teshuvot 696:14. This could have real halachic implications since there are potential heterim which only apply to dressing up on Purim - eg whether one is allowed to dress in the other gender's clothing.

69. See also Mishna Berura 695:10.

70. This year (2021) when Purim falls on Feb 26, in most locations this is around 3.15pm (Gra) or 4.00pm (Magen Avraham).

71. See Meiri Ketubot 7a who writes that this was the custom in his locale.

72. The Arizal writes that Ma'ariv must always be before kiddush - see Kaf Hachaim 271:22. Additionally, Kabbalat Shabbat and Bame Madlikin were intended to be recited around candle-lighting time, not later in the evening.

73. Either due to the concerns of the Arizal, the likelihood of losing a minyan for Ma'ariv, and the fact that the Purim spirit (pun intended) is not always in keeping with that of Shabbat. Some poskim also consider this to be a violation of 'ain osin mitzvot chavilot chavilot' - not to bundle together mitzvot, in this case the seudot of Purim and Shabbat.

74. Halichot Shelomo 11:5; Ve'alehu Lo Yibol I, p. 349.